Reviewer’s report

Title: Smoking and mental illness: Results from population surveys in Australia and the United States

Version: 1 Date: 8 May 2009

Reviewer: Daniel W O'Connor

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

This is a most interesting and well-written report of the association found in three large national Australian and US surveys between smoking and mental disorder. The paper would benefit nonetheless from greater attention to the co-occurrence of smoking and substance abuse which is barely addressed in the results and discussion sections despite its obvious clinical and public policy implications.

Young people who smoke (and especially young women) have higher rates of mental disorder than older smokers and more of their mental disorders are likely to take the form of alcohol and/or drug abuse. Young smokers with mental disorders are likely to differ therefore from older smokers with mental disorders in important ways that will shape their use of health services, response to educational programs and pricing structures. To add value to the existing literature, it will be important to include more detailed analysis and discussion of this important interaction.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.