Reviewer's report

Title: Preventing weight gain: the delivery of a randomized controlled intervention in community based women

Version: 1 Date: 25 August 2008

Reviewer: Antronette (Toni) Yancey

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. The paper seems to be reporting only baseline data, when the title and first sentence of the Methods section in the abstract suggest that process data is included. These should be corrected.

2. 4th para of Background section: self-efficacy is described in global terms when it is generally behavior-specific--this should be clarified. Also most approaches have demonstrated short-term success, so if there’s something about ref#15 that’s pertinent to this intervention, it should be noted--current sentence doesn’t add much.

3. Was size the only variable used in the block randomization? If so, it's quite amazing that randomization worked so well. Might want to mention in Method section the rationale for using only school size. Table 1 is really useful, with its provision of the national along with the local data.

4. Should give the denominator of eligible women in the text as well as Fig 1.

5. Define "ongoing support for 1 year" in the last paragraph of the "Intervention Group" section.

6. Would be useful to know how eating and PA behaviors were distributed by weight status. Authors might want to consult Timperio et al., Public Health Nutr, 2000; Biddle & Fox, Int J Obes Relat Metab Disord, 1998; Yancey et al., Obesity, 2006; and/or others re the importance and utility of these analyses.

7. Sustainability of the intervention should be discussed, since the investigators used the school setting as a staging venue, but did not intervene much with the environment--institutionalization in some way seems feasible, but is not addressed in the Discussion.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.