Reviewer's report

Title: Weight perception, dissatisfaction, control practices and their associations in low-income African American adolescents

Version: 3 Date: 29 January 2009

Reviewer: Sarah Mitchell

Reviewer's report:

This is a clearly-written and interesting paper about an important topic. Overall I think this paper has something to add to the literature, I just have some possible amendments to improve the manuscript:

Discretionary Revisions:

• Page 6 line 78: It would be useful to discuss what the ethnic and gender differences are in the prevalence of overweight in African American adolescents.

• Page 6 line 90: Rather than using the term "actual behaviors" in the aim, it would be clearer to state the specific behaviors you aimed to examine e.g. dietary intake, physical activity and sedentary behaviors.

• Page 6 line 98: Figure 1- Given that the first aim was to examine the associations between actual body weight status, body weight perception and body dissatisfaction etc, I am wondering if Figure 1 could also include body dissatisfaction to show how this variable fits in to your conceptual framework.

• Page 6 line 110: I am unsure what a "student body that was not highly mobile means". Could this be described for non-American readers.

• Table 1. Given that the sample size changes for all participants, participants with BMI<85th percentile, BMI # 85th percentile and BMI # 95th percentile, it would be useful to include the sample size for each of these categories, rather than stating it up the top just for the whole sample.

• It would add to the literature to explore body weight perception and weight control practices for those classified as underweight. This information could be included in Table 1.

• It would be interesting to see descriptive statistics for the eating, physical activity and sedentary variables, especially as a highlighted strength of the
study in the discussion is the detailed information regarding the participants’ eating and physical activity patterns. Also were there any outliers for these variables and if so how were they managed?

• Consider deleting either figure 2 & 3 or the percentages reported in text to make it less repetitive.

Minor Essential Revisions

• Table 1. Participants with BMI<85th needs to be changed to BMI<85th and include the word percentile.

• Page 13 line 269: Include body dissatisfaction rather than satisfaction to keep consistent with the aim.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests