Reviewer's report

Title: The denominator problem: Estimating MSM-specific incidence of sexually transmitted infections and prevalence of HIV using population sizes of MSM derived from Internet surveys

Version: 1 Date: 22 February 2009

Reviewer: Onno de Zwart

Reviewer's report:

The decision to submit two related manuscripts, 'The denominator problem...' and 'Estimating the regional distribution' has helped very much to clarify the reasoning in both the manuscripts.

The issues from my review of the original manuscript have been addressed.

One minor issue:
- In figure 1a it would be helpful to name the two regions with a high HIV incidence in Southern Germany. Especially for non-German readers that would be helpful. Would it be possible that the high HIV incidence in these regions was related to people from the neighbouring countries who got tested in Germany?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.