Reviewer's report

Title: Reduction in young male suicide rates in Scotland: an epidemiological study

Version: 1 Date: 13 March 2007

Reviewer: Paul S YIP

Reviewer's report:

General
The paper gives a descriptive study on the change of suicide rates in Scotland. It will be of interest if the results can be compared with the UK as a whole.

________________________________________________________________________

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The cutoff of 15-29 is a bit unusual. Usually we take 15-24 or even 15-19 which is more likely to be affected by the media publicity. It will be useful if we can have further breakdown of the age group 15-29.

It will also be useful for the international audience why Hanging is so common in Scotland, are they more likely to suffer from mental illness?

Some of explanations are rather speculative, it will be useful if more concrete evidence can be provided. The figures can be better arranged.

________________________________________________________________________

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

________________________________________________________________________

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

________________________________________________________________________

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I have no competing interest