Reviewer's report

**Title:** Circumcision during manhood initiation rituals in the Eastern Cape, South Africa: a prepost intervention evaluation

**Version:** 2 **Date:** 22 January 2008

**Reviewer:** Robert Van Howe

**Reviewer's report:**

Very interesting study. Well executed and designed. Well written. Only a few touches will make it better.

Major Compulsory Revisions:
1. Needs an abstract. (either that or I couldn't find it)
2. In the discussion section need to emphasize the danger of the procedure, even with their intervention of additional training.
3. In the discussion section need to give recommendations for making the intervention safer. Elaborate on where to go with the information gathered in this study.

Minor Essential Revisions:
There are a couple of typographical errors. "ha" instead of "had" and a "]" missing after a citation.

Discretionary Revisions:
None.

**What next?** Accept after minor essential revisions

**Level of interest:** An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.