Reviewer's report

Title: An evaluation of alcohol attendances to an inner city emergency department before and after the introduction of the UK Licensing Act 2003.

Version: 2 Date: 18 June 2008

Reviewer: Robert Patton

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for addressing the concerns raised in my previous review. I am generally satisfied that most of the points made have been dealt with.

Major compulsory revisions:

1. You need to clarify exactly what is meant by inconsequential alcohol related attendances - in the methods section you state that documentation that the patient had been drinking prior to attendance was defined as alcohol related, however in your response to my previous comment you indicate that cases of inconsequential consumption were not included in the study - on what basis was such consumption defined? Is it the case that only in cases were drinking prior to attendance was deemed as related then this was recorded? Some statement about the formal recording of alcohol consumption and the way in which inconsequential use is defined and determined may help to clarify the situation. I still suggest that you adopt the term "attendances where alcohol use was documented".

2. SIPS is cited as a formal screening questionnaire. This is not the case. SIPS is a large multicentre RCT that will evaluate different alcohol screening questionnaires in the AED - the PAT, The AUDIT and the SASQ. SIPS should also be appropriately referenced.

Minor essential revisions:

1. The paragraph that begins "Retrospective studies" has the phrase "No formal" that appears to be text left over from a previous version of the paragraph. This should be removed.

Discretionary revisions:

1. It may be enlightening to include a proxy measure of alcohol related attendances, such as the number of assaults / violence presentations. There is good evidence that many of these are alcohol related.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'