Reviewer's report

Title: Alcohol use and misuse: What is the contribution of occupation and work organization conditions?

Version: 2 Date: 28 January 2008

Reviewer: Paul Roman

Reviewer's report:

This appears to be a very well informed manuscript that suffers on occasion from inappropriate translation from what I assume is French. I would have been able to provide a rapid commentary on these problems had not the ms. been in PDF form and thus locked to commentary.

The investigator opens the paper with a quite clear exposition of hypotheses, except for the gender issue, which has been found of quite dramatic significance in the broader literature, and which in this instance seems relegated to an afterthought. With such a large N of subjects, the opportunity to address gender issues presents itself very generously. Then, when harassment appears as an important variable, the design which includes both genders instead of modeling them separately, misses an overwhelming number of opportunities.

Given the findings that have emerged in this analysis, I would strongly suggest that the authors distinguish gender in their further analyses. There is no doubt that men harass men, and perhaps that women harass men, but the governing model here is one of men harassing women. As it stands, that is not explicated in the analysis.

The author fails to consider the possibility of self selection into these occupational settings by persons with a propensity to drink more heavily. Unfortunately the cross sectional design does not allow for addressing these concerns.

The author is greatly limited by his/her data, but the intervening variable of union membership is measured so weakly that it raises major concern. It is obviously a protective factor between being able to be an active problem drinker and suffer few consequences. The discussion does not appear to address this.

Given the findings, I would suggest that this ms. might have a huge contribution to the literature on women's harassment experience in the workplace and drinking behavior.

Otherwise it is a reasonable piece, but its cross-sectional design unfortunately would have it join a long line of boring and inconclusive articles that say the workplace affects drinking, but not really saying much that is either new or, in particular, practical in terms of leading to suggestions for organizational change.