Reviewer's report

Title: Alcohol use and misuse: What is the contribution of occupation and work organization conditions?

Version: 2 Date: 20 November 2007

Reviewer: Mitch Earleywine

Reviewer's report:

General

This is an interesting data set that could address some intriguing questions. The current draft is very difficult to read, with some expressions that show a lack of understanding of English idiom. For example, a sentence in the abstract reads: "Family situation, social support outside work, and personal characteristics of individuals are also associated with alcohol use and misuse and they mediate-suppress the role of occupations and work organizations conditions." I honestly have no idea what this sentence means.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

With a sample size that exceeds 10,000, it is important to consider statistically significant effects with caution. A large sample can make very small, potentially meaningless effects, reach statistical significance. Over 50 statistical tests appear in the paper, with 95% confidence intervals. With no correction for Type I error, I am not sure which of the statistically significant findings to take seriously. In addition, only 1 odds-ratio exceeds 2.0, with many of the statistically significant ones falling below 1.1. (The large sample makes these statistically significant.) I cannot get particularly excited about statistically significant predictor if it doesn’t increase risk by 10%; most epidemiologists would scoff at anything with an odds-ratio below 2.0. Given the small size of these effects, I do not see that these data add anything to the literature.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject because too small an advance to publish
Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.