Reviewer's report

Title: Physical activity as an aid to smoking cessation during pregnancy: two feasibility studies

Version: 2 Date: 11 July 2008

Reviewer: Stephen T Higgins

Reviewer's report:

This revised manuscript is appropriately detailed, cautious and responsive to the concerns expressed in the prior reviews. I have no further suggestions for changes.

Point for authors future consideration: I raised a concern in the prior review that the < 8 ppm CO cutpoint was too liberal for verifying abstinence among pregnant smokers. The authors responded by underscoring that this cutpoint is the one recommended by SRNT and likely appropriate for an urban setting like London. With all due respect to SRNT and concerns about ambient CO levels, I remain confident that the cutpoint is too high for use with pregnant women although not that this caused any amount of inflation in the current results that warrants worry. In both studies mean CO levels were below 4 ppm, which is about where I would anticipate them to be in abstinent women. The upper end of the ranges in the two studies suggests that there may have been a women in each study who continued doing a bit of smoking but nothing to worry about. Out of scientific interest, I encourage the authors to investigate this matter further in the clinical trial that appears to be underway if time and resources permit. This might be a nice contribution to make while waiting for the trial to finish and one that is important to this area of investigation.

I commend the authors on this interesting report and clever intervention, and I look forward to learning how the controlled trial works out.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.