Reviewer's report

Title: The impact of a minimal smoking cessation intervention for pregnant women and their partners on perinatal smoking behaviour in primary health care: a real-life controlled study

Version: 2 Date: 8 May 2008

Reviewer: Agneta Hjalmarson

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

On page 9 paragraph 2. Few of the women who were asked to participate refused. How did you collect that information? This should only be under discussion if you did not collect data about it.

On page 9 Background and characteristics of the intervention and control cohort. The text should have a reference to a table (Table 2).

Remove the dropouts from table 2. A suggestion is to make a separate table for those not responding to the 6 weeks follow and put the information you have about the non-responder in this table.

On page 13 Participants and drop outs. In the first paragraph is stated that some 44% took part in the PACT study, but the next paragraph says that 56% were available for postnatal follow-up. How could that be? It is not clear what you mean.

The study had two types of attrition. They were connected to 1. Responding to Q1=included in the study and 2. Response rate (Q2) at 6 weeks. I think it would be easier to read the paper if the attrition you talk about is clearly related to either included (response rate for Q1) and response rate at follow-up (Q2).

Minor Essential Revisions

Table 2 is presented before table 1 (page 5 last sentence in the paragraph Cohorts and subjects ). My suggestion is to omit the last sentence in this paragraph and instead on page 9 under Results (Background characteristics of the intervention and control cohort) refer to table 2 in the text.

Figure 1: You have used two systems in the figure, so either write participant rates and response rates in their respective boxes and omit the drop-out box or change the inclusion boxes accordingly: Write the actual number of women who had the first antenatal check-up, add an extra box with not included patients (like you did with the dropouts) and in a new box the number who answer to Q1 and then continue with drop-outs and the follow-up boxes as you already have done.
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'