Reviewer's report

Title: Secular changes in height, weight and body mass index in Hong Kong Children

Version: 1 Date: 21 May 2008

Reviewer: Han C Kemper

Reviewer's report:

1. the purpose of this study is to compare height, weight and BMI from three big samples of children in Hong Kong measured 30 (1993) and 12 (1993) years apart. The cross sectional design is ideal to answer the research question about secular trends. This is not clear formulated in abstract (background) and in the paragraph background. Not clear in the abstract, background and methods is that secular changes were made in three populations. It became clear in the tables 1,2, and 3.

2. methods are well described and also the way percentile curves are calculated. They have to include a paragraph about the way the same methods of weight, height and BMI are used in the three years (1963,1993 and 20

3. the collected data are sound and well controlled by trained staff

4. results are relevant and clear. Authors have to explain why they not used the 1963 data for comparison of overweight (table 3)and also not in the figures.

5. discussion and conclusions are well balanced

6. limitations are stated in the paper

7. publications cited are relevant

8. abstract (see above) is not clear and does not inform about 1963 comparison

9. writing is sometimes too abundant but acceptable

the suggestions for revision are major and compulsory.