Reviewer’s report

Title: Secular changes in height, weight and body mass index in Hong Kong Children

Version: 1 Date: 26 March 2008

Reviewer: Timothy A Welborn

Reviewer’s report:

“Secular changes in height, weight and body mass index in Hong Kong children”
by H K So and colleagues

This article should be accepted for publication after minor essential revisions.

It describes an important public health issue that is well researched and reported. The statistical methods will require an expert’s opinion.

In the Introduction and Discussion, the use of the Hong Kong Student Health Service criteria for obesity (> 120% of the median weight-for height) is cited. Reservation about this (unsatisfactory) parameter should be expressed, together with acknowledgement that the use of BMI is currently the accepted WHO standard.

Also under Methods:-

(1) More details are required about the accuracy of the scales, any quality control measures used, for example the use of standard weights to validate the telephone output.

(2) How was “random selection” of the schools achieved – by a card system, or use of random numbers, or another method? “Arbitrary” selection may be the more appropriate phrase.

Review by:
Dr Tim Welborn, Department of Endocrinology, Sir Charles Gairdner Hospital, Nedlands, Western Australia

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests