Reviewer’s report

Title: Lifestyle behaviors, obesity, and perceived health among men with and without a diagnosis of prostate cancer: a population-based, cross-sectional study

Version: 1 Date: 5 June 2007

Reviewer: Maureen Sanderson

Reviewer’s report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

3. Page 8, paragraph 2 – The authors should match on age using a 4:1 control:survivor ratio since there is more than a 15 year age difference in survivors and controls and adjustment for age would not appear to be sufficient to overcome this substantial difference.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

4. Page 8, paragraph 2 – The authors should categorize race/ethnicity more finely than black/non-black.

5. Page 9, paragraph 2 – The authors should assess confounding by other risk factors rather than just adjusting based on the literature.

6. Page 9, paragraph 3 – The authors should assess effect modification and present p-values for interaction by age, race, education and urbanicity and provide justification for the possibility of biological differences for each of these variables.

7. Page 11, paragraph 1 – The authors should not comment on changes between unadjusted and adjusted odds ratios since this just proves adjustment was necessary to control confounding.

8. Page 12, paragraph 2 – The authors should mention a real limitation of the study, the inclusion of men with other cancers.

9. Page 13, paragraph 2 – The authors provide no justification for why measurement error should be similar in survivors and controls, since an illness generally results in recall bias.

10. Table 1 – The authors should include a column of p-values.

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

1. Page 5, paragraph 1 – The authors should reword “…poorer treatment response and survival in cancers other than prostate.” As “…poorer treatment response and survival in head and neck cancer, and lung cancer.” Since these cancers are clearly associated with smoking.

2. Page 5, paragraph 1 – The authors should reword “…higher alcohol intake has been associated with reduced survival in cancer other than prostate.” As “…higher alcohol intake has been associated with reduced survival in breast cancer.” Since both papers refer to breast cancer.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions
Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.