Reviewer’s report

Title: Health, poverty and cognitive function in pre-school children: a cohort study in a middle income urban context

Version: 4 Date: 19 November 2007

Reviewer: Margaret Caughey

Reviewer’s report:

This is the second revision of a manuscript reviewed twice before. Despite the authors’ efforts, the revision remains unsatisfactory. The background section is poorly developed. It is repetitive. A theoretical or conceptual reason for focusing on effects of parasitic illness on cognitive development is still not provided. This draft also sees the curious introduction of a consideration of neighborhood effects on cognitive development into the background section. However, because the introduction is poorly integrated, it is unclear what relevance neighborhood effects have for the current investigation. Indeed, although a neighborhood variable is included in the results, the specific neighborhood variable is never described in the methods section.

The draft is riddled with grammatical and spelling errors.

Because of significant limitations in conceptual development, the results of this study do not add significantly to our understanding of the mechanisms by which poverty affect child cognitive development.

What next?: Reject because scientifically unsound

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests