Reviewer's report

Title: Declining career preference for and image about the profession of youth health physician among Dutch medical students

Version: 4 Date: 25 June 2007

Reviewer: Barbara Buddeberg-Fischer

Reviewer's report:

General
The authors address interesting issues for those related to these issues. The methods are well described, and sufficient details provided to replicate the work. The data are sound and well controlled.
Discussion and conclusions are balanced and supported by the data. Title and abstract convey what has been found.
The manuscript is too long because of the inappropriate data presentation.
Statistics and data presentation have to be improved.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Suggestions to improve statistics and data presentation:
1.) Repeated splitting of the sample in two subsamples with multiple comparisons causes a significant higher alpha error.
2.) The 47 characteristics of YHP should be analyzed by factorial analysis to reduce the amount of data.
3.) Instead of the multiple group comparisons the authors should conduct a three group comparison (one-way ANOVA): students with high preference to YHP, with low preference to YHP and actually working YHPs.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'