Reviewer’s report

Title: The body politic: a reexamination of the cause of obesity-associated disease.

Version: 2 Date: 8 February 2008

Reviewer: Angelo Tremblay

Reviewer’s report:

The paper submitted by Dr. Muennig is a well written paper that comments on very interesting issues. This manuscript is also perceived as a courageous piece of work, as exemplified in the last paragraph of page 21 when the author indicates that public health officials might well have exacerbated the obesity-related problems. Despite this positive appreciation, this reviewer proposes several suggestions that could improve the content of the paper but that the author should consider as facultative.

1. Page 15, first paragraph: It would be relevant to cite the paper of Tremblay and Doucet (Obes. Rev. 1:27-35, 2000) who described some metabolic side effects resulting from body weight loss in obese individuals.

2. Page 20, last complete paragraph: The content of this paragraph seems to be concordant with the study of Chaput and Tremblay (Physiol. Behav. 90: 66-72, 2007) who showed that mental work, which is maybe a source of stress, increases ad libitum energy intake.

3. Conclusion: This section is very long, probably too long. This reviewer suggests to transfer some elements of discussion in the main part of the paper. The conclusion will then be more focused on the summary of key points.

What next?: Accept without revision

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.