Reviewer’s report

Title: Epidemiology and health economic analysis of injury in Shandong Province, China

Version: 6 Date: 18 October 2007

Reviewer: Mei Wen

Reviewer’s report:

General

The paper is mainly a descriptive study on major injuries in the surveyed areas, health economic analysis is comparatively weak with little description and discussion.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

-------

I still think it is not appropriate to use YPLL without age weighting and discounting to evaluate such a rare event as injury death and morbidities.

How representative this study is to Shangdong Province? Hope some discussion will be included. For it is only a very small portion of the whole population.

It is assumed the multivariate logistic regression is linear in Table 5, how about goodness of fit to the data? Besides, for this table, whether the regression is run including all the variables?

For severity of the injury, it is hard to measure based on self-reported data. And using whether to go to hospital and days of rest as a measure of severity can be misleading.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Reference for the first paragraph in the background should be included.

What is the standard for classifying rural areas into 1, 2, 3?

It would be better to write in more detail about the calculation of direct cost and the two indirect cost.
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

On top of page 9, there is estimation on the cases and deaths of injury in Shangdong in 2003, just wonder whether the reported number by the government is available to see how good this estimation is.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.