Reviewer's report

Title: Epidemiology and health economic analysis of injury in Shandong Province, China

Version: 3 Date: 16 May 2007

Reviewer: Peter Byass

General

This paper presents an analysis of injury patterns in Shandong Province, China, based on a retrospective household survey. Generally the survey seems to have been well conducted and written up. However, it is not clear that it adds anything very substantial to existing understanding of community-based injury epidemiology in southeast Asia (and the literature reviewed in the paper is less than complete). It could be of interest to publish within China, rather than internationally.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

More detailed comparison with other studies in southeast Asia would strengthen the paper.

Most of the methodology seems sound, though there is one important statistical point overlooked. There were 1,772 injury episodes among 1,655 respondents, but as far as I can see you have not looked at the potential within-respondent clustering of the 117 second or subsequent injuries. This means that the 1,772 injury episodes are not necessarily statistically independent entities, which may need to be taken into account in the analysis.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

--------------------------------------------------------------------------

What next?: Reject because too small an advance to publish

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.