Reviewer's report

Title: The role of paternal psychosocial work condition on mental health of their children: A case-control study

Version: 2 Date: 8 October 2007

Reviewer: Johannes Siegrist

Reviewer's report:

The revised version of the manuscript, in combination with the authors' response to reviewers, resulted in substantial clarifications and improvements. Most major and minor concerns of my former review have been met. However, I recommend to revise the part of Discussion where it is stated that 'Specific aspects of paternal work stress play different roles in the onset of mental health outcomes from childhood to adulthood' (p. 15). As no theoretically grounded hypothesis has been developed a priori it is not clear how to interpret findings and to what extent results are robust. Causal interpretations (neurochemistry, biological embedding etc.) should only be stated with great care.

Although the extended table of results is welcome I do not think it is appropriate to confront readers with such extensive data. Hopefully, a way of condensing relevant findings for a clear-cut scientific paper can be elaborated.

Finally, just a short feedback to authors concerning my suggestion to refer to Melvin Kohn's work. This was not meant to provide direct empirical evidence of an association between work characteristics with children's mental health. Rather, I suggested Kohn's work to provide an explanatory framework for this association.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests