Reviewer’s report

Title: Media suicide-reports, Internet use and the occurrence of suicides between 1987 and 2005 in Japan

Version: 3 Date: 12 September 2007

Reviewer: Paul S Yip

Reviewer’s report:

The authors seem to include all the reviewers’ comments into the discussion as the limitation of the study. In certain sense, they have addressed all the concerns. But, I still have three follow-up questions.

i) In the first manuscript, the authors found the association between suicides and media reports (same month). And in the second manuscript, they show the association between suicides and media reports (previous month). I suspect that the association is just a spurious relationship between suicide deaths in this month and suicide deaths in previous month (autocorrelation).

I am interested to know the result if the suicide deaths in previous month is included as independent variable into the model.

ii) On p.11 and 12, the authors explain why they can only work on monthly data and "Phillips noted that monthly suicide data can be problematic, and Bollen and Phillips used daily data instead of monthly data". Pls state specifically how this may have undermined the validity of the result.

iii) I am still a bit concern over the extent of exposure to suicide website. Does any survey in Japan show how often people have an exposure to the suicide website? If there is only small percentage, how could this exposure affect the overall suicide rate in Japan?