Reviewer's report

Title: Media suicide-reports, Internet use and the occurrence of suicides between 1987 and 2005 in Japan

Version: 3 Date: 8 August 2007

Reviewer: Gernot Sonneck

Reviewer's report:

General
Review II „Media suicide-reports, Internet use and the occurrence of suicides between 1987 and 2005 in Japan“.

Compared to the first submission, the authors
• analyzed stationary suicide data,
• used independent variables of the previous month,
• controlled for unemployment
• have cited more English-speaking literature
• and have noted several limitations to their analysis.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Ia. Monthly suicide data is still used and was not replaced by daily data. Phillips and Bollen (1982) pointed out the importance of this issue.

Ib. The use of the word "suicide" in the articles was not analyzed: Because of the worldwide reporting of suicide bombing attacks in recent years this will probably lead to biased results.

If the articles are not available in this source, at least their headlines and dates of publication should be collected from available databases to analyze this question.

It would clearly increase the quality of research if the points mentioned above were considered.

II. In the revised form, data were log-transformed. Commercial internet was first implemented in late 1992, which data did you log-transform in the period 1987-1992? Please explain.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of
a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

I. p.8., line 15: please check you p-values (0.5 for internet use is not significant)

II. Please check reference 10: The correct title is "Assessing the impact of media guidelines for reporting on suicides in Austria"
The correct journal is Australian N Z J of Psychiatry.

III. It would be interesting to include a figure of the data (suicides, article numbers, internet use, unemployment) in order to visualize the data.

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

**What next?:** Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.