Reviewer’s report

Title: Before and after study of bar workers’ perceptions of the impact of smoke-free workplace legislation in the Republic of Ireland

Version: 3 Date: 23 January 2007

Reviewer: Stanton Glantz

Reviewer’s report:

General

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

While somewhat improved from the previous version, the fact is that few readers will make the distinction between PERCEIVED adverse economic impacts and ACTUAL economic impacts. The authors still imply that there were actual negative short term economic impacts.

As I see it, there are two options:

1. Add an analysis of the actual economic impact (which, based on the added material will probably either be nill or positive) and make the point that, as elsewhere, the perceptions did not match reality (or, if it turns out that there was a negative impact, that perceptions did match reality).

2. Delete the material on economic impact and present it later, when it can be done in proper context.

Option 1 would be better, because it would provide a more complete picture of the data. Option 2 would be acceptable, because it would avoid presenting a MISLEADING picture of reality.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.