Reviewer’s report

Title: The Impact of Fathers Physical and Psychosocial Work Conditions on Attempted and Completed Suicide Among their Children

Version: 3 Date: 2 February 2006

Reviewer: Gustavo Turecki

Reviewer’s report:

There are still numerous grammatical errors in the text. Errors include, but are not limited to, the following:

• P15 incorrect verb tense: ‘attenuated’
• P15 word repetition: ‘it is likely that, because of the few clinics in existence, that only’
• P16 punctuation: ‘with the, now well’; p16 ‘to control, in analysis at least partially, for the impact’
• P16 use of which when that is appropriate: ‘this investigation builds upon an older literature which has’

Though the authors have addressed the age of fathers in 1985, and thus only a partial control for fathers’ history of suicide and mental health, the incorrect age has been reported (the authors report an average age of 35 years, when according to Hertzman et al, 1997 fathers’ would have been on average 50 years of age).

The authors do not discuss the reduced risk for suicide associated with the ‘tradesman’ occupation among male children. The reported p-value suggests that this is a significant relationship, yet it is not mentioned in the results section nor is it to be found in the discussion.

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'