Reviewer's report

Title: Prevalence and determinants of asthma in adult male leather tannery workers in Karachi, Pakistan: A cross sectional study

Version: 2 Date: 7 October 2006

Reviewer: Eva Andersson

Reviewer's report:

General
This paper on asthma among leather tannery workers in Pakistan has been revised and most of the issues raised have been answered and changes have been made.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Abstract 3d paragraph row 7: “For” should be removed to make the sentence correct. Should be “Those who...”

Comment on the new text page 3, 2nd paragraph: I’m not convinced from the literature that skin problems usually is a stage in development of asthma from chromium and would suggest a weaker word on row 4, instead of “appears to be” use “could be” or something similar to that. As nothing is said in the paper about COPD I will also suggest to change row 7 to “those of respiratory tract and skin”.

page 3, parag 3, row 2, word 9 studies instead of study
page 4, parag 2, row 1, should be Korangi industrial area
page 6, parag 4, row 3 “biologically meaningfully” is questionable, should need further explanation and I suggest that it will be removed.

What next?: Accept after discretionary revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests