Reviewer’s report

Title: Diet Induced Weight Loss Increases Satiety in Obese Women

Version: 1 Date: 30 March 2005

Reviewer: Stylianos Nicolaidis

Reviewer’s report:

General

As a whole, this ms can be published with minor changes. We know Cabanac’s well documented position over the changes of alliesthesia (A) considered as a criterion of reaching a given set point or not. Admitting such a criterion the present investigation is valid and the conclusions hold. However, if this excellent team wants to improve the impact of the article some more basic improvements should be made, given that the present investigation is been continued and more data are expected to arise. In that sense, two or three major improvements could be considered: The cohort in question has reached a new set point and this is why negative A comes earlier than on the first test. That is OK; but, why does A come earlier and not as in the first test, when the subjects were also at their (by that time, under the M regimen they were consuming) set point? Second, OK, the subjects reached a new SP; The present SP is being defended under the new conditions, ie the new M regimen. Should we understand that, in order to maintain this new SP these subjects must continue consuming permanently this new artificial regimen? What if they returned to their usual one?

In the present case subjects were at their SP before the beginning and also, the authors believe, at the end of the M regimen. Shouldn’t they display the same, not a shortened A?

Another argument that would better convince the reader would be provided by a control group where the subjects would follow the same series of tests, same timing etc but, either they would not loose weight or would not follow the treatment at all between the two tests. Such a control can be justified because one could expect the changes in A could be related merely to the subject’s previous experience of having passed the testing procedure once before (ie schedule-induced learning). Add to that the 40 S reward. Some minor changes are also suggested:

P 3 the word equilibrium may be misleading. It is used in chemistry and has a precise meaning. It could be replaced by balance.

P 3 The idea of exteroceptive (cephalic and post-cephalic) stimuli affecting internal regulatory processes was well shown in the 60ies. Designated anticipatory reflexes (NY Acad Sci 1969) they prepare, at a preabsorptive stage the classic postabsorptive processes (neuro-endocrin).

P 5 creating survival curve; Explain or give reference.

P 9 ..d intake of 1800 to 2400 kc/d depending on energy needs. Who measured these energy needs?

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the
Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)