Reviewer's report

**Title:** Endemic cryptosporidiosis and exposure to municipal tap water in persons with acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS): A case-control study

**Authors:**
- Dr Tomas J Aragon (aragon@itsa.ucsf.edu)
- Suzanne Novotny (slea04@cs.com)
- Wayne Enanoria (enanoria@uclink.berkeley.edu)
- Dr Duc J Vugia (dvugia@dhs.ca.gov)
- Dr Asheena Khalakdina (asheena@socrates.berkeley.edu)
- Mitchell H Katz (mkatz@sfdph.org)

**Version:** 1  Date: 18 Nov 2002

**Reviewer:** Dr Gordon Taylor

**Level of interest:** A paper of considerable general medical or scientific interest

**Advice on publication:** Accept without revision

This is a very interesting and well written paper. The authors have undertaken a carefully designed and implemented case-control study have written up the results in a clear and concise manner and found some very interesting findings. The authors are also well aware of the limitations of their study and have fully described these limitations within the paper.

I therefore only have two comments on the paper.

The paper does not mention whether IRB approval has been sought for this study and assurance of this must be sought. The authors have gone to considerable lengths to contact patients with up to three phone calls and two letters. Additionally, as an English reviewer, it is unlikely that the method of obtaining the names to recruit would be considered as ethical within the UK. However, I am not fully aware of the situation in the USA and obviously knowing that it had IRB approval would remove these concerns.

I was surprised at the small size of the potential group of control subjects. My experience of undertaking case-control studies is that a large bank of possible controls are required to obtain adequate matches to the cases. In this study out of a bank of 168 people 99 were matched to cases. However, this may be because of the homogeneous nature of this group.

**Competing interests:**

None declared.