Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of Greek Orthodox Christian Church fasting on serum lipids and obesity.

Authors:

Ms Katerina O. Sarri (katsarri@med.uoc.gr)
Nikolaos E. Tzanakis (tzanakis@med.uoc.gr)
Manolis K. Linardakis (linman@med.uoc.gr)
George D. Mamalakis (geor40@yahoo.com)
Anthony G. Kafatos (kafatos@med.uoc.gr)

Version: 2 Date: 10 Mar 2003

Reviewer: Abayomi Akanji

Level of interest: A paper of limited interest

Advice on publication: Accept after discretionary revisions

I have reviewed the manuscript again. The authors have responded to most of the issues raised by both reviewers. There are however still some serious concerns:
(1) can we really talk about fasting here? My understanding is that the 'fasters' only go through some periods of modified diet but otherwise feed throughout the day -in other words, they adopt a near vegetarian diet at some specified periods during the year. This is different from Ramadan fasting when individuals do without all food for about 10-12 hours daily! It is probable that, in this study, caloric intake is maintained, but content modified. The manuscript should clearly indicate that - in the title and text. It may also help if daily caloric intake and distribution (CHO, fat, protein, fiber) during the 'fasting' period is indicated in comparison to during the 'non-fasting' period. My feeling is that this probably varies significantly from day to day.
(2) in talking about weight changes, maybe weight should be used rather than BMI alone.
(3) for Tables 3 and 5, up to about half (Table 3) and one-third (table 5) of subjects are excluded for reasons of incomplete data collection. Surely this must reflect on the robustness of the data and the conclusions reached - moreso as the results were not replicated when the fasting group was sub-divided.
(4) the discussion section remains unnecessarily long (6 printed pages). There are still many repetitions - the length could be satisfactorily reduced by half.

Competing interests:

None declared.