Reviewer's report

Title: Smoking in cars in England: a study of school students in an English city

Version: 2  Date: 11 April 2014

Reviewer: Brian King

Reviewer’s report:

The authors have made a good faith effort to address the comments suggested by both reviewers. This original reviewer is generally satisfied with the revisions and recommends publication of the manuscript. However, a few additionally points should be considered prior to final publication.

1) It appears that the terms "rules" and "laws" are used interchangeably in the manuscript (e.g. conclusion section of abstract). A "law" typically denotes a legal action passed by a legislative body, while "rule" represents a voluntary action taken on the part of individual entities or individuals. Thus, in this case, I believe the appropriate term is "rule".

2) I believe my comment with regard to the inclusion of percentages in the table may have been misinterpreted. In the original review, I was requesting the percentages of respondents in each subpopulation who reported each outcome. For example, what proportion of boys reported that smoking was allowed in the family car (all boy respondents is the denominator). As currently presented, the percentages are just the distribution of responses across all categories within a given variable. The former approach is most useful for public health messaging.

3) It's unfortunate that the recommendation to force all variables into the multivariate model was not heeded. This lessens the utility of the findings for the purposes of public health practice. When messaging this content to key decision makers, it's most useful to show that all variables have been accounted for in the final model; discussing the statistically intricacies of likelihood ratios is a futile endeavor to these individuals, and thus, it's best to frame the methods and presentation of results in the clearest manner possible.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests to declare.