Reviewer's report

Title: HIV Behavioural Interventions Targeted Towards Older Adults: a Systematic Review

Version: 4 Date: 10 October 2013

Reviewer: India Butler

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Reviews
Despite improving the flow of this review I still find the original research question to be too broad. The authors need to motivate why it is possible to bring such diverse topics into one systematic review. It is difficult to synthesise the studies selected into a cohesive answer to the research question because the studies included are so heterogenous and the research question is too all-embracing. They mention "specific emphasis on treatment adherence, increased HIV knowledge, reduced risk behaviour as well as social and physical support" which represents a wide range of issues. Although the steps in the process of a systematic review appear to have been followed (they reference the PRISMA statement) I feel the weakness lies in the start of this process, namely the rationale and the specific objectives.

Within the studies referenced critique of the internal validity is not adequately clear. They mention the ROADMAP trial as being one of the "most successful" interventions but I think that comparisons should not be made among such differing studies.

It is also unlikely that the findings of the studies reviewed will be applicable (even in the Americas) due to the very small numbers, the lack of information supplied regarding recruitment of study participants and whether they are representative.

The overall benefit of this review is to identify the lack of data in all the areas mentioned and perhaps it would be more appropriate as a preamble to a proposed study rather than a stand-alone systematic review.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests