Reviewer's report

Title: Metropolitan-level ethnic residential segregation, racial identity, and body mass index among U.S. Hispanics: a multilevel cross-sectional study

Version: 2 Date: 29 October 2013

Reviewer: Nancy Lopez

Reviewer's report:

Yes publish this article; it adds value to the analysis of the role of segregation and how it may manifest differently among racially stigmatized communities. However please encourage the authors to recognize more limitations. First, the BRFSS does not allow for "some other race" as an option that read to participants so the data underestimate the number of people who would have chosen this option. Given this important shortcoming the findings need to be interpreted with more caution.

Second there is valuable health related research that examines the value added by socially defined race that should be included:

Camara et al. 2008 Socially Defined Race and Health Status
Gravlee et al 2005 Blood pressure in Puerto Rico
Lopez & Gomez 2013 "Mapping 'Race': Critical Approaches to Health Disparities Research"

And finally if this article is to be read by a wider audience, the authors may want to consider making it more readable and less technical. For example, it need to explain how segregation was conceptualized more fully. Was segregation simply living in an area that had a high percentage of any kind of Hispanic or was it limited to just Black neighborhoods. Whatever the operationalization of segregation was a bit hard to grasp conceptually.