Weight Gain & Smoking: Perceptions and experiences of obese quitline participants
Bush, Hsu, Levine & Magnusson

This paper presents the results of a qualitative research project which sought to explore smoking and weight related issues among obese callers to two smoking cessation quitlines. Overall this is a well written paper on an important topic, and I found the results interesting.

I believe the manuscript could be improved. Please consider the following suggestions.

General:
-Avoid using “some, many, several.” Given the nature of the data, the findings would be clearer if the exact numbers are provided.
-Consider providing a brief summary at the beginning of the Discussion section of the key findings. Perhaps frame as “Although there was variability across our sample, in general the following themes were most commonly expressed by the participants…..
-Why 29 Obese Smokers? I suspect this can be best answered by providing more context in the recruitment section.

Specific:
-Line 62-65. Provide more detail regarding recruitment and how ended up with n=29.
-Drop the line stating that Alere is the largest provider of quitline services and how many states, etc. are served. This reads as direct promotion of Alere and is not relevant to the research. It is reasonable to state that the 2 quitlines used in the study were run by Alere and that they completed the initial screening.
-Line 67-71. Clarify if the screener was standard for the quitlines or specific to this study.
-Line 81. Typo, “on a scale or”, should read, “on a scale of”
-Line 101. It would be interesting to see this data presented by BMI category
-Line 139. Typo 6participants
Consider changing to “These unclear responses may highlight the difficulties obese smokers perceive facing when….”

I was surprised with this statement as previous participant comments suggested high motivation to either quit smoking or address both smoking and weight.

Typo 4stents

Consider adding “To the best of our knowledge, this paper is the first….”

Is “or” the correct word here? Sentence is confusing.

Do the current findings suggest results from studies regarding intolerance of moderate weight gain may be less true for obese smokers?

Unclear how this sentence fits here

Most of these citations are for normal weight or specific populations (College women). Are these relevant obese smokers? Do the current findings suggest anything which may be unique about obese smokers compared to normal weight, both as related to body image and also in general?

Consider changing “a lot of tough issues” to something less colloquial.

The sample is characterized as having limited health insurance, but only 14/29 were uninsured. Consider modifying to something which indicates that nearly half were uninsured.

Thank you for the opportunity to review this manuscript.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.