Reviewer's report

Title: Association between physical and mental health-related quality of life and adverse outcomes; a retrospective cohort study of 5,272 Scottish adults

Version: 4  Date: 24 October 2014

Reviewer: Chiara de Waure

Reviewer's report:

I thank the Authors of the paper for improving the article. Notwithstanding, I would like to bring the attention to few final pending points with. In the amended version, Authors stated that adiposity may be considered a mediator in the association between HRQoL and adverse outcomes. Correctly, they tested BMI for interaction and, following the evidence of no interaction, they considered the variable as a confounder in the Cox model. Anyway, in the discussion, Authors stated that HRQoL may influence lifestyles. Indeed, also the latter could act as a mediator and interaction should be tested before using them as adjusting variables. Furthermore, I would point out that the reference to the collection of saliva and urine samples is still there in methods section but Authors did not specify which kind of information they got from them. Finally, I believe that the sentence “Furthermore, one of the reasons of no significant association in MCS may be that SF-12 only detects the mental health wellbeing and not the severe mental disease” (in discussion) does not make a lot of sense if Authors relies on HRQoL as an indicator of health status able to address health aspects which are difficult to capture by objective measurements (such as a severe mental disease).

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests