Reviewer's report

Title: The incidence variation of prostate and cervical cancer according to socioeconomic level in the Girona Health Region.

Version: 3  Date: 8 July 2014

Reviewer: Amy Griffin

Reviewer's report:

The authors have responded appropriately to the concerns I expressed about their original submission. I think there is now a more coherent description of their findings and the potential implications for cancer control.

The only compulsory revisions I have to suggest are to clean up the English in the revised manuscript. While generally intelligible, I did have to read some sections multiple times to make sure I was catching your meaning correctly. A professional copyeditor or native speaker of English and some knowledge of medical research should be able to help with this.

I would also like to respond to one comment the authors made. They state that:

"But it also is not easy to construct maps when you have a design-space interactions between the two dimensions. We mean, what map would be more representative of the association? (if any). That of the first year? The last year? Or rather the evolution of the association?"

My answer would be that you need a series of maps. Rarely is one map going to tell you everything about a data set anyway. Moreover, in the revised manuscript, the authors note:

"In fact, in all cases, spatial dependency dominates, with a typical deviation practically twice that of temporal dependency. This may mean that the spatial pattern for both types of cancer has remained stable during the period considered."

This implies that you could choose any year's map and it should then represent the association fairly well. The value of adding a map is that for people unfamiliar with the geography and population distribution of your region (most readers of this article), it orients them to the spatial variability in cancer rates. Without a map, it is difficult to tell if there are only tiny variations between places or very strong variations. Relationships can be significant without being strong, and mapping rates can help readers to understand whether this is the case in the context of Girona.
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.