Reviewer's report

Title: Tuberculosis case finding based on symptom screening among immigrants, refugees and asylum seekers in Rome

Version: 2 Date: 24 June 2013

Reviewer: Yecai Liu

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript was well written, and the findings may be important on identifying TB cases in some migrant populations.

Major Compulsory Revisions:

1) The authors divided the study population into two groups: 1) persons with "at least one symptom suggestive of active TB, and 2) persons with "no symptoms". When the authors presented the results of TB cases diagnosed by the symptom screening, they combined the results of these two groups. What was the reason for doing so? If the authors wanted to evaluate the effectiveness of symptom screening, the 5 referred persons from the "No symptoms" group should not be included.

2) There was 45% of referred persons with at least one symptom of suggestive of active TB did not attend diagnostic evaluation. The low participation rate might cause bias on the results of the analysis, especially with a small number of people attended diagnostic evaluation. Did the authors compared some factors (e.g., age, gender, birth country, year of stay in Italy, etc) between those who attended the diagnostic evaluation and those who did not attended the diagnostic evaluation?

Discretionary Revisions

1) Before the foreign-born persons participated this study, did any of them undergo TB screening?

2) The length of time spent in Italy is important in this analysis. Can the authors provide more detailed information (e.g., the percent or number of persons spent <=1 year, 2-5 year, >=6 years in Italy; page 7, line 123)?

3) The number of symptoms might improve the diagnosis of TB. Can the authors analyze the data by using the number of symptoms (e.g, 1 symptom and >=2 symptoms).

4) From the table, 68.4% of persons in the study population were from countries with a TB incidence >=100 cases per 100 population per year. It would be helpful if the authors also put these results into the Results section on page 7.
5) What were the "other symptoms" for referring the 10 persons from "No symptoms" group to TB diagnostic evaluation?

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.