Reviewer's report

Title: The odd man out in Sub-Saharan Africa: Understanding the tobacco use behavior in Madagascar

Version: 3 Date: 20 March 2013

Reviewer: Ahmed Mandil

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:
Methods Section:
Please indicate:
- why you chose to use secondary analysis, using DHS data, rather than use standard WHO/CDC survey tools, e.g. GATS, etc?
- why was there gender imbalance in your sample?
- what was the case-definition of a "current smoker" adopted in your work?

Results & Discussion:
- please clarify the possible effect of "marital status" on "smoking status, as it seems contradictory between what is mentioned in the Results section versus Discussion section

Minor Essential Revisions:
Introduction:
Last paragraph: please change the objectives' verbes into past tense

Methods: you may wish to change "secondary education" into "high-school education"; "higher education" into "university education", so that people from different parts of the world would identify with such categories similarly

Results:
- Figures 1a and 1b: please re-arrange countries in both graphs in a "decrescendo order" as far as smoking status distribution by gender: more impressive and easier interpretation
- Table 1: please move "total columns" to the far right, as these sum up other categories
- Table 2: please suffice with two decimal points for all results (point estimates and 95 % confidence intervals): simpler and provides standardization of results' reporting in the same table

Discussion:
- I enjoyed reading it. You may wish to highlight how different the situation is in Madagascar, in comparison to other SSA nations in your study
- Please remove the statements which follow reference (35) to the "Conclusion &
Acknowledgements:
Please indicate in which city, country is the mentioned "College of Public Health"

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
I declare that I have no competing interests