Reviewer's report

Title: Physical and mental health issues for adolescents transitioning to university life

Version: 2 Date: 11 January 2013

Reviewer: Victor Schwartz

Reviewer's report:

I have several general concerns about this paper and a few specific ones:

1) on page 4, data presented from the 2008 ACHA survey—there are data available online as recent as 2012. why such old data?

2) i would have appreciated clearer description of the nature and demographics of this university—public, private, student body is homogeneous/heterogeneous ethnically/socio-economically?

3) i am not well versed in statistics but was confused by the discussion of association between fatigue and psychological distress—on page 11 it appears there is an association and then on pg 13 "there was no direct relationship between psychological distress and fatigue".

4) the comments about access to health services were also confusing, what percentage of students mentioned counseling?

5) again, i think the issues of "fatigue" and the subjective reports of "ill-health" were interesting but felt not adequately or clearly enough fleshed out.

6) in general, i found the attempts to analyze the data more confusing than they were clarifying my understanding of the data.

i feel these general concerns raise the issue of needing significant revisions in order to clarify the evaluation and conclusions drawn from the data.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

no competing interests.