Reviewer's report

Title: Epidemiology of smoking among Malaysian male adults: Prevalence and associated factors

Version: 1 Date: 13 July 2012

Reviewer: Monika Arora

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions
None

Minor essential revisions
1. P3, para1, line2: Current estimate is 1.3 billion smokers globally
2. P3, para1, line2: 'Global smokers' should be replaced by 'smokers globally'. A good copy editing of entire manuscript will improve comprehension and quality of manuscript.
3. P3, para1, line4: Please provide reference for projection of 8.3 million deaths in 2030.
4. P4, line 1-7: Sentence too long and difficult to comprehend. Kindly break it into 2 or more sentences
5. P4, last 6 lines: Sentence too long and difficult to comprehend. Kindly break it into 2 or more sentences
6. P6, line 1: Please disclose the 'response rate' in 'results' section.
7. P6, line 1: Please clarify in the beginning itself that study if only 'adult males' were surveyed OR if all were surveyed and authors extracted data of adult males from it.
8. P8, para 1, line 1: 15,639 respondents. However, in methodology section, 15,369 respondents have been mentioned. Also, please clarify that '15639 were adult male respondents'
9. P8, para 1, line 4: Prevalence data in 40-50 years age group is missing.
10. P10, para1, line 1: Please mention that it is prevalence of smoking in 'adult males'
11. P10, para1, line 4: Sentence needs reframing. "The smoking prevalence reported in this paper (46.4%) is 2.8% lower than that reported a decade ago (49.2% in 1996). The decrease observed is modest.". Kindly provide p value as well of the comparison like you have provided for other comparisons later in this paper.
12. P10, para1, line 9-14: Sentence too long and difficult to comprehend. Kindly break it into 2 or more sentences
13. P10, para2, line1: Please mention that it is adult males data being compared
"...... comparable smoking prevalence in adult males, are....."

14. P10, para2, line2: Data of India is incorrect. Smoking prevalence in adult males in India is 24.3%.

15. P11, 3rd last line: Sentence needs to be reframed as.."Since, so many develop smoking.............., a major effort is needed to direct.................".

16. P12, para 2, 4th last line: Authors need to mention the objective criteria used for assigning the status as 'manageable' and 'moderate'. In absence of a defined criteria, this sentence will need to be dropped.

17. P13, para 2: Read comment 2 in discretionary revisions

18. P14, para 2, 5th last line: Do we have any data on quitting to support the argument?

19. P15, para 2, 6th last line: Sentence needs to be grammatically corrected. It uses both singular and plural forms.

20. P16, para 2, last line: Replace "translated' by "addressed"

21. P16, para 3, line 4: Replace "smoking biochemical markers" with "biochemical markers of smoking".

22. P16, para 3, 2nd last line: Mention 'response rate' at the beginning of 'results' section.

Discretionary revisions

1. Global Adult Tobacco Survey (GATS) has recently been completed in Malaysia and supposed to be a gold standard for tobacco related information. It's fact sheet is also available on CDC website. Inclusion of this recent high quality data can make this paper more robust.

2. P8, para 1, line 4: Can authors explain reason for the trend observed with respect to age-groups in the discussion section later? Is it because quitting rate exceeds initiation rate after 30 years of age? If so, can you substantiate explanation with initiation and quitting rates in different age groups? or is it because of possible cohort effect where smoking rates are higher in recent decades? A short discussion on this trend would be useful.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'