Reviewer’s report

Title: The impact of the Cyprus comprehensive smoking ban on air quality and economic business of hospitality venues

Version: 2 Date: 30 August 2012

Reviewer: Ana Navas-Acien

Reviewer’s report:

This study evaluates changes in PM2.5 concentrations in 35 venues before, and 21 venues both before and after the implementation of a smoke-free legislation in Cyprus. In addition, information on legislation enforcement and on the economical impact of the legislation is provided.

Limitations of the study include the small sample size for the PM2.5 measurements. Also, many studies have already been reported with similar findings and it is unclear what are the research innovations this study contributes to advance the field.

Additional comments:

- The background is long and generic, it needs to be more specific, describe better the characteristics of the Cyprus legislation, and summarize better previous studies conducted in this topic (making sure that they are correctly classified by comprehensive vs. no-comprehensive legislation, for instance Israel does not have a comprehensive legislation, so the small reduction is not a surprise).

- The economical debate that the authors mention in the introduction is not well documented. Actually, nowadays it is generally accepted that good research has shown that there is no economical damage.

- The description of the PM2.5 monitoring can be substantially shortened as it is well established and there are good descriptions of it.

- PM2.5 is generally very skewed and it is better to use medians or geometric means as measures of central tendency instead of the mean.

- I disagree with the comment in the discussion that prior to the Cypriot law the vast majority of clean indoor air laws were passed in nations with low smoking rates and where enforcement was perceived as relatively easy. Indeed before Cyprus, countries such as England, Uruguay and Italy had passed smoking laws. In Uruguay, for instance the smoking prevalence is among the highest in the Americas and perception about the possibility of success was not high. However, monitoring data from Uruguay has shown that implementation of the legislation was largely successful.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

No conflict of interest