Reviewer's report

Title: A pilot study comparing two weight loss maintenance interventions among low-income, mid-life women

Version: 1 Date: 21 March 2013

Reviewer: Gustavo Silva

Reviewer's report:

General Comments

Overall, the manuscript entitled “A pilot study comparing two weight loss maintenance interventions among low-income, mid-life women” is well written. The topic is very interest and up to date. It seems to be a follow-up study from a randomized controlled trial, which successfully reduced weight in low-income women. The study’s rationale, purposes and methods are clear and well described. However, the statistical procedures and the presentation of results seem confused. Thus, some suggestions are made in order turn the presentation of results in a comprehensive way.

Major Compulsory Revisions

Data presentation and analysis are unclear. Authors should consider a different approach. The presentation of continuous variables, such as weight (and weight gain or loss), should be presented as mean ± standard deviation. For the above-mentioned continuous variables, please consider using Student T-tests, ANOVAs or the respective alternative for non-parametric test. I honestly suspect that there are differences between groups and across time in the mean for weight, weight change and weight regain. If the mentioned differences exist, the maintenance weight program might not be that effective. Also, the addition of some effect size measure, such as partial eta square, would be informative. If these changes in the analyses lead to different conclusions, please make changes in the manuscript accordingly. Please, if the authors disagree with the suggested approach, give us some thought about it.

Minor Essential Revisions

Table 1 – Please, consider change “Weight Change” and Weight Regain” to “Weight Change (kg)” and “Weight Change (kg)”

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I have no conflict of interest.