**Reviewer’s report**

**Title:** Tobacco Control in the Russian Federation - A Policy Analysis

**Version:** 5  **Date:** 12 November 2012

**Reviewer:** Andrey Demin

**Reviewer’s report:**

The question posed by the authors is well defined.
The methods used are appropriate and well described.
The data are sound in terms that available sources of information are used.
The manuscript adheres to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition.
The discussion and conclusions are well balanced and adequately supported by the data.
The authors clearly acknowledge any work upon which they are building, both published and unpublished.
The title and abstract accurately convey what has been found.
The writing is acceptable.

Other points that might require consideration:

Policy context. Third paragraph. Annual spending looks underestimated in view of the annual production in price of 13 Bln USD.

Health effects
First paragraph. Life expectancy data looks obsolete.

General: The need to implement Article 5.3 of the FCTC could be emphasized, as well as the need to counter smuggling from Russia.
Effect of harmonization of policies within Euroasian Economic Cooperation organization could be further discussed.
The world tobacco control community, including WHO, should consider Russia as a primary target of the industry, with regional and global impact, and act accordingly.

**Level of interest:** An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: 'I declare that I have no competing interests'