Reviewer's report

Title: The impact of education programs on smoking prevention: a randomized controlled trial among 11 to 14 year olds in Aceh, Indonesia

Version: 4 Date: 6 March 2013

Reviewer: Yan Wang

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript has been improved since original submission

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. In the method part, the authors mentioned that they use "robust standard errors to account for clustering within each classroom". However, the authors stated in the note of table 3 that "results are for the main effects of health and Islam-based groups from a mixed effects model." Mixed model (multilevel modeling) is not the same as model with robust standard errors.

2. For power analysis, it is not appropriate to ignore the clustering within schools in group randomization design since the design effect might be very high when the number of students in each school is large.

3. Due to the differences of outcome variables by intervention status at baseline, the limitation of group randomization design (a weaker randomized design) should be discussed.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.