Reviewer’s report

Title: Concomitant malaria among visceral leishmaniasis in-patients from Gedarif and Sennar States, Sudan: a retrospective case-control study

Version: 2 Date: 11 February 2013

Reviewer: Shaden Kamhawi

Reviewer’s report:

The authors gave satisfactory replies to my inquiries, however, for several points, listed below, the authors explained the reasoning to me but did not clarify in the manuscript. Please make the requested additions to the text.

1- The authors’ response to: [the paragraph under subtitle “Demographic and clinical features of…”: authors mention reduction of cases of co-infection by age but have to clarify that this is not observed in single infections with VL.] does not clarify the point in the manuscript. The authors need to be clear that the ‘Reduction of co-infection cases by age, as described here, indicates that the chance of detecting malaria in patients already diagnosed with VL decreased as age increased.” In the manuscript.

2- The authors need to emphasize the peculiarity of the co-infections in the dry season by adding their response “as it highlights a peculiar feature of these co-infections (malaria usually occurs in the rainy season, while VL in the dry season).” to the text of the manuscript if it is not there...

3- the inquiry “It is peculiar that in Al’Azaza kala-azar Clinic and Tabarakallah most cases were in young boys and in Gedarif Teaching Hospital it was mainly girls…do the authors have an explanation of why that may be?”

The authros’ response that the gender differences were not significant and that the sample size is small should be emphasized in the results text

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'