Reviewer's report

**Title:** Age at menarche and its relationship to body mass index among adolescent girls in Kuwait

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 7 December 2012

**Reviewer:** Ali Prof. Assabri

**Reviewer's report:**

This study described the age at menarche among school girls in Kuwait, an oil-rich country in the Gulf region. It has also investigated the link between obesity and the age at menarche. The study is well written and of great importance not least because of the lack of data from the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries. I have looked at the publications on this topic and found ample amount literature from every part of the world (even African countries) but there is practically none from GCC countries. GCC countries have a distinct nature of being high-income countries in area where all other countries are low-income including those in WHO-Eastern Mediterranean Region. I like the way the authors outlined the rationale for their study presenting the main two reasons- increasing the rates of childhood obesity and changing of the socio-economic status due to oil prices.

I have a few minor comments for the authors to consider; as highlighted below.

**Introduction:**

- This seems to be concise and straight to the point and- as I said, I liked the rationale presented here.
- End of 1st paragraph, “…,hence guiding the clinical evaluation” please delete this- or rewrite the whole sentence.

**Methods:**

- 1st para, “….. Kuwait which typically include…” need comma before “which”
- 2nd para, “because ethnic and cultural …” Please remove the word “ethnic”-
- The ethnic make-up of people in GCC is diverse
- You said Arabic version of the questionnaire was tested- on how many study subjects?
- Did you use the English version for those who speak only English?
- Please turn some sentences to active voice in the 3rd para- but also through the paper.
- 4th para “95%CI……” start the sentence with “The” to avoid starting the sentence with a number.

**Results:**

3rd para; indicate (either in the methods or here in the results) whether or not the
obese girls are included in overweight category according to this definition. One strength here, is that the authors have looked at the age at menarche in various ways using age at menarche as a categorical and a continuous variable-I think this made their conclusion robust and convincing.

Discussion:
- I have to say that I liked the sentence that referred to the wisdom of G. Rose.
- 4th para; second sentence “…..for white American girls (7.8) but lower than that..” is the ref number 54 for both white and black girls? If so, you need to cite it twice.
- 5th para , “.Another explanation suggest..” should be “suggests”

Abstract: Result, 3rd sentence; “ The Prevalence ..................was 8.5%(95% ci: 7.0-10.2)” add % to the numbers in the ci.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interest