Reviewer’s report

Title: Is Asthma a Vanishing Disease? A Study to Forecast the Burden of Asthma in 2022

Version: 1 Date: 16 December 2012

Reviewer: May Nawal Lutfiyya

Reviewer’s report:

Review---IS ASTHMA A VANISHING DISEASE? A STUDY TO FORECAST THE BURDEN OF ASTHMA IN 2022

Reviewer: M. Nawal Lutfiyya

The objective of this study was to use observed population trends data of asthma incidence and prevalence to forecast future disease burden.

Administrative data from the province of Ontario was used to answer the question.

The question posed by the authors is well-defined and the methods appropriate and well described. The data are sound BUT there is no careful appraisal of the limitations of such data. All too often it is assumed that the administrative health data in Canada represents all cases of disease. Some attempt should be made to estimate undiagnosed and untreated cases of asthma. While Canada does have a universal health care system there are groups of people (e.g., some classes of immigrants) who are not eligible for universal health care. The limitations to the data that such poses should at the very least be mentioned. That said the data overall are sound.

The manuscript adheres to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition and the discussion and conclusions are well balanced and adequately supported by the data. Many of the limitations of the work are clearly stated, although the data issues mentioned above should be addressed.

One other concern is the conclusions drawn regarding prevalence rates in urban versus rural populations. In the US there is considerable research that supports the observation that the prevalence of asthma is higher in rural populations. Further, there is considerable evidence that minority groups shoulder a greater burden of the disease than non-minorities. The authors should give some consideration to, if nothing else, the differences between their observations regarding rural asthma prevalence and what others have found (albeit in the US).

Throughout the manuscript, the authors do clearly acknowledge work upon which they are building. Furthermore, the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found.
The writing is acceptable.
Any suggested revisions are discretionary.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
I declare that I have no competing interests