Reviewer’s report

Title: Reproducibility of Physical Activity Recall over Fifteen Years: Longitudinal Evidence from the CARDIA Study

Version: 1 Date: 12 November 2012

Reviewer: Barbara Ainsworth

Reviewer’s report:

This paper reads very well and informs researchers about the ability and value of measuring historical PA. The overestimation and underestimation of activities performed does give one pause for the historical recall of PA.

MINOR ESSENTIAL REVISIONS

I am familiar with the CARDIA PA questionnaire used at baseline, but the manuscript is not very clear what PAQ was used to assess historical PA. Was a structured interview used or just another CARDIA PAQ assessed with the goal to remember 15 years ago?

The tables and figures are pretty dense and add a lot of information about the responses. I think talking more about the tables and figures in the discussion would make the data in the tables and figures “come alive”. As they are presented now, they are somewhat of an add-on that needs to be studied to be understood. Figures 2-4 would benefit from more discussion. Also, can you give the reader confidence in what are the types of activities that can be recalled best, aside from vigorous PA?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: No competing interests, financial or otherwise