Reviewer's report

Title: Chronic disease prevalence from Italian administrative databases in the VALORE project: a validation through comparison of population estimates with general practice databases and national survey

Version: 4 Date: 23 July 2012

Reviewer: Francesco Chini

Reviewer's report:

Overall Comments:
This study provides an interesting comparison of different data sources to estimate the prevalence of chronic conditions for a single geographic area. The key objective is to assess whether a method for ascertaining cases based on administrative database produces estimates that agree with the estimates from other data sources (general practise database and national survey). While I believe that the study has merit, the manuscript requires substantial revisions.

Major Compulsory Revisions:
Add in the table and figure the overall data (union data of five regions). This can also give an overview of the Italian context given that there are region of north central and southern Italy.

Stratify prevalence by age for diabetes mellitus, ischaemic hearth disease an COPD and comments any difference like you did for hearth failure.

For administrative database the author had for patients a unique coded personal identifier for a single regions. Why were used capture-recapture techniques (only administrative database) to estimate the prevalence for any regions? These methods can give estimate prevalence more consistent.

Minor Essential Revisions:
Broaden the discussion with a paragraph on the limitations of the study.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests.

Quality of written English: Acceptable.

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declar that I have no competing interests.
Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.