Reviewer's report

Title: Mortality and potential years of life lost attributable to alcohol consumption in Canada in 2005

Version: 2 Date: 12 July 2011

Reviewer: Kerena Eckert

Reviewer's report:

This is a well written paper. The authors use new methodology to estimate the deaths caused and prevented by alcohol and potential years of life lost due to alcohol consumption in Canada in 2005. The results clearly build on their previous work in this area. However, given the sophistication of several of the statistical techniques used I wonder whether this paper would be better suited to BMC research methods. Notwithstanding, all my comments are minor.

Major compulsory revisions:

None

Minor essential revisions:

Abstract

The second ‘were’ in the sentence beginning ‘Indicators for alcohol consumption has...' should be removed.

In the results section the word ‘represents’ should be replaced with ‘represent’.

Introduction

Page 4: (2nd paragraph), the word ‘Canada’ is repeated twice.

Page 4: There is some duplication in the text with the objectives reported on page 4 and again on page 6.

Page 6: The overall weighted participation rate in the CADUMS (one of the main data sources used for the study) is very low 36.5%. Although this is considered as a limitation later in the paper it would be useful to have some information on why the rate is so low.
Page 7: Need to insert a reference for the Canadian NESARC study.

Page 14, paragraph 1 – Several of the numbers in the text do not correspond with those reported in Table 2.

Discretionary revisions:

Page 5: As most of the text in the paragraphs on this page describes methodological techniques they should perhaps be inserted in the methods section.

Page 7, Did the authors give some consideration to the proportion of women who experience fetal loss earlier in their pregnancy?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests