Reviewer's report

Title: The predictive validity of three self-report screening instruments for identifying frail older people in the community

Version: 2 Date: 16 October 2011

Reviewer: Ivan Bautmans

Reviewer's report:

The authors improved their manuscript and most of my remarks were responded adequately. There are 3 remaining issues, for which I invite the authors to respond more explicitly:

1/Comment 1: What is the risk that elderly persons presenting cognitive impairments participate in the study, thus affecting the validity of the selfreported data?

2/Comment 3: How did the authors compute "the average value" for a dichotomous outcome measure?

3/Comment 5: Table 3 & discussion page 11: More detailed information regarding the origin & type of change in disability level is needed in order to appropriately appreciate the clinical implications of the predictive values of the frailty scales under study.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'