Reviewer's report

Title: Unintentional injury mortality in India, 2005: nationally representative mortality survey of 1.1 million homes

Version: 1 Date: 29 November 2011

Reviewer: Zafar Fatmi

Reviewer's report:

General comments:
The objectives of the paper is well defined. Methods are clearly written however category of “falls of objects” results were not given.

- Major Compulsory Revisions: Distinction between a rural area and health facility death is vague. As health facilities are also present in rural as well as urban areas. Therefore, all deaths cannot take place either in rural areas or health facility.

International comparison was not done anywhere in the discussion with any other country.

Table 1 compares number of unintentional injury deaths in the current study with rates in other studies. This comparison is not valid. Number of deaths does not give a good idea of estimates.

Table 2 again compares SMR per 100,000 with number of deaths which gives no clue for comparison between the two figures. The study sample says that the study was conducted between 2001-2003 which is discrepant from 2005 as described elsewhere.

Table 3 is appropriate comparison. However, “Others unintentional injuries” have not been clearly defined. Asterisks are not explained in the legend below the table. Question numbers such as “V90-V98….“ do not make sense to a reader. Please explain the type of injuries. Table 3 is not referred in the text.

Figure on cause of death was made based on proportion of deaths at each age group. It should have been made on rates rather proportions for all international comparison.

- Minor Essential Revisions

The graph on place of death is not making sense. For example most of the RTI is occurring at “other” places. What does that mean? Mechanical forces has been explained in the method section. Why national rank was given alongside proportion of the place of deaths.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests